



NEW YORK
CITY BAR

**REPORT ON LEGISLATION
BY THE ANIMAL LAW COMMITTEE**

Int. 573-2022

A LOCAL LAW to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to the operation of horse drawn carriages and to replace the horse drawn carriage industry with a horseless electric carriage program, and to repeal sections 17-334.1, 19-174, subdivision c of section 20-374, sections 20-377, 20-377.1, 20-380, 20-381, 20-381.1, 20-381.2, 20-382 and subdivisions b, c, and d of section 20-383 of the administrative code of the city of New York, relating to the regulation of horses used in the operation of a horse drawn cab and horse drawn cabs.

Sponsors: Robert F. Holden, Erik D. Bottcher, Tiffany Cabán, Rita C. Joseph, Keith Powers, Christopher Marte, Joann Ariola, Shahana K. Hanif, Kristin Richardson Jordan, Jennifer Gutiérrez, Pierina Ana Sanchez, Rafael Salamanca, Jr., Sandy Nurse, Julie Won, Shekar Krishnan, Crystal Hudson, Lincoln Restler, Chi A. Ossé

THIS LEGISLATION IS APPROVED

I. BILL SUMMARY

The proposed legislation¹ would prohibit the operation of horse-drawn carriages, effective June 1, 2024. All licenses for the operation of a horse drawn carriage will expire on that date. Horse-drawn carriages would be replaced by low-speed, horseless electric carriages — an all-

¹ Int. 573-2022, available at <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=5725261&GUID=08B70306-1523-4CCB-A8AB-1C506CB58635>. (All internet sources cited in this report were last visited on March 22, 2023.)

The Animal Law Committee has issued several reports and testimony supporting bills that either phase out or restrict the carriage horse industry. See, e.g., NYC Bar Association Animal Law Committee, Report on Intro. 1425-2019 (Jun. 6, 2019), https://s3.amazonaws.com/documents.nycbar.org/files/2019541-Carriage_Horse_Heat_Relief.pdf; Testimony on Department of Transportation Rules Governing Horse Carriage Passenger Boarding Areas (Oct. 3, 2018), <https://s3.amazonaws.com/documents.nycbar.org/files/2018434-HorseCarriagePassengerBoardingAreas.pdf>; Report on Intro. 573-2014 (Nov. 12, 2015), <http://www2.nycbar.org/pdf/report/uploads/20072858-ReportandSupportofIntro0573-2014ToBanCarriageHorsesinNYC.pdf>; Report on A.997/S.667 (Feb. 11, 2013), <http://www2.nycbar.org/pdf/report/uploads/20072178-ReportonA.7748-S.5013whichwouldprohibittheoperationofhorsedrawncarriagesinNewYorkCitySeptember2011.pdf>; Report on Intro. 86-2010 (Apr. 1, 2010), <https://www.nycbar.org/pdf/report/uploads/20071886-CommentinIntro86reHorseDrawnCarriages.pdf>.

About the Association

The mission of the New York City Bar Association, which was founded in 1870 and has over 23,000 members, is to equip and mobilize a diverse legal profession to practice with excellence, promote reform of the law, and uphold the rule of law and access to justice in support of a fair society and the public interest in our community, our nation, and throughout the world.

electric, zero emission, low speed vehicle driven by a licensed horseless electric carriage driver — providing trips within Central Park and certain areas of Manhattan. Within Central Park, speed of the cabs would be limited to 3 mph.

Under the legislation the City would establish a program, by June 1, 2023, to lease or sell the electric horseless carriages. The City would issue no more than 68 licenses for such vehicles. Priority for the lease or sale of electric horseless carriages would be given to former owners of horse-drawn carriage licenses. Former horse drawn carriage drivers would also be given priority for issuance of licenses under the new program. The City would establish a program for owners to pay carriage drivers a prevailing wage, to be set by the Comptroller.

II. JUSTIFICATION

Although various local laws govern carriage horses and carriage operation,² the current legal approach to the industry — regulation — does not adequately protect horses from the dangers inherent in pulling carriages in the urban environment of New York City. Winding down the use of carriage horses is the only way to meaningfully protect these animals.

Currently the City’s laws permit a horse carriage, a conveyance dating back to Ancient Mesopotamia,³ to share the streets with cars, commercial trucks, double-decker buses, emergency vehicles, and countless other modes of transportation that make New York City one of the most congested places in the world.⁴ Because the horses live in stables on Manhattan’s West Side while they operate in Central Park, working horses are effectively *required* to make a hazardous one-and-a-half mile trek, twice a day, through city traffic. And, indeed, the commute is hazardous: although New York City has just 68 licensed carriages,⁵ accidents and other incidents involving horses happen regularly. Some incidents involve direct collisions between horses and vehicles; others occur when the loud noises and quick movements endemic to midtown Manhattan “spook” horses into bolting. The attached Exhibit A lists several dozen incidents that have occurred since 2006, many of which resulted in injuries to people as well as horses.⁶

² See N.Y.C. Admin. Code §§ 17-326 – 17-334.1; 19-174 – 19-175; 20-371 – 384; 6 R.C.N.Y. § 2-212; 24 R.C.N.Y. §§ 4-01 – 4-06; 34 R.C.N.Y. §§ 4-01 – 4-16; 56 R.C.N.Y. §§ 1-04, 1-05, 1-07.

³ Armas Salonen, *Notes on Wagons and Chariots in Ancient Mesopotamia* 2 (1950); Margaret Evans, “A Carriage Ride Through History,” *Horse Journals* (Dec. 31, 2021), <https://www.horsejournals.com/life-horses/carriage-ride-through-history>.

⁴ Helen Chandler-Wilde, “These Are the World’s Most Congested Cities,” Bloomberg (Jan. 10, 2023), <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2023-01-10/these-are-the-world-s-most-congested-cities>.

⁵ Sarah Maslin Nir, “Viral Video of Horse Collapse Reignites Debate: Do Carriages Belong?” *N.Y. Times* (Oct. 4, 2022), <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/09/21/nyregion/carriage-horses-new-york.html>.

⁶ See, e.g., *Teen on Bike Struck by Horse and Carriage in Central Park*, New York Post (Aug. 13, 2015), <http://nypost.com/2015/08/13/pedestrian-struck-by-horse-and-carriage-in-central-park/>; see also Jeff Mays, *Horse Carriages Involved in 25 Accidents Since 2009, NYPD Reports Show*, DNAinfo (Oct. 29, 2014), <https://www.dnainfo.com/new-york/2014/10/29/midtown/horse-carriages-involved-25-accidents-since-2010-nypd-reports-show/>.

Traffic is not the only danger these horses face. For nine hours a day,⁷ seven days a week,⁸ a horse working in Central Park can pull a vehicle loaded with five adults (four passengers and a driver)⁹ in temperatures as low as 18 degrees Fahrenheit and as high as 90 degrees Fahrenheit.¹⁰ During their commutes to and from the park they are exposed to motor vehicle exhaust, a harmful irritant to a horse's respiratory system.¹¹ Not surprisingly, even setting aside the dangers of traffic, several horses have collapsed while working.¹² Exhibit A again lists several incidents.

When horses are not pulling carriages, they live in conditions that fail to suit their needs. The horses are kept in multi-story buildings in Manhattan's Hell's Kitchen,¹³ a rapidly developing area of "high-rises and heavy traffic."¹⁴ Within these buildings horses can be housed in stalls as small as sixty square feet, with a minimum width of seven feet.¹⁵ Stables need to provide only enough space for the horse to "turn around and safely lay down within the stall."¹⁶ The stables lack any pastures or paddocks,¹⁷ so cannot provide horses with the daily "turnout" recommended by

⁷ N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 17-330(g)(1). Rules promulgated by the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene limit a horse's workday to ten hours. 24 R.C.N.Y. § 4-05(c)(1). But the Administrative Code's nine-hour limit should govern. *See* New York City Council, Bill Drafting Manual: A Guide to Researching and Writing Legislation for New York City 5 (2d ed. 2018) ("Local legislation generally trumps an agency rule, except where provided by state or federal authority."), available at <https://council.nyc.gov/legislation/wp-content/uploads/sites/55/2018/04/BDM-Final-2018-Version.pdf>.

⁸ The Code requires that horses receive at least five weeks of furlough each year, though proof of the furlough must be provided only upon request. N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 17-330(g)(2).

⁹ 6 R.C.N.Y. § 2-212(q)(7).

¹⁰ N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 17-330(o). On humid days the maximum temperature in which horses can work is 80 degrees. *See also* 24 R.C.N.Y. § 4-05(b)(2).

¹¹ Center for Equine Health, School of Veterinary Medicine, University of California, Davis, CEH Horse Report: Transporting Horses by Road and Air, Recommendations for Reducing the Stress 9 (2013), https://ceh.vetmed.ucdavis.edu/sites/g/files/dgvnsk4536/files/local_resources/pdfs/pubs-July2013HR-sec.pdf.

¹² *See, e.g.*, Elisha Fieldstadt, "Carriage Horse Collapses on Hot NYC Street as Driver Says, 'Get Up! Get Up!'," *Today* (Aug. 11, 2022), <https://www.today.com/pets/pets/carriage-horse-collapses-nyc-renewing-bid-ban-practice-rcna42666> (documenting a horse collapsing on an 87-degree day); Michael Gold, "An N.Y.C. Carriage Horse Died. Video of Its Collapse Stirred Outrage," *N.Y. Times* (Mar. 2, 2020), <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/02/nyregion/horse-carriage-collapse-nyc.html> (documenting a horse's collapse and euthanization later that day). The horse in the August 2022 incident died two months later. Christopher Brito, "Ryder, the Carriage Horse Who Collapsed on a New York City Street in August, Has Died," *CBS News* (Oct. 18, 2022), <https://www.cbsnews.com/news/ryder-carriage-horse-died-new-york-city-collapse/>.

¹³ Sarah Maslin Nir, "Viral Video of Horse Collapse Reignites Debate: Do Carriages Belong?" note 5 above.

¹⁴ Aileen Jacobson, "Rapid Change in Hell's Kitchen," *N.Y. Times* (Apr. 29, 2015), <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/05/03/realestate/rapid-change-in-hells-kitchen.html>.

¹⁵ N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 17-330(c).

¹⁶ *Id.*

¹⁷ Sarah Maslin Nir, "Viral Video of Horse Collapse Reignites Debate: Do Carriages Belong?" note 5 above.

veterinarians as “crucial to [a] horse’s health and well-being.”¹⁸ Instead, a horse’s only opportunity for turnout in a pasture or paddock is during the five weeks of annual furlough mandated by law.¹⁹

III. CONCLUSION

Attempts to regulate the carriage horse industry have not — and cannot — prevent accidents or eliminate the dangers inherent in their daily lives: traversing the congested streets of midtown Manhattan; pulling people and carriages every day; and living without daily turnout. This legislation, which would phase out the use of carriage horses in New York City, is the only way to meaningfully protect these animals.²⁰

For these reasons the New York City Bar Association’s Animal Law Committee supports the proposed legislation.

Animal Law Committee
Rebecca Seltzer, Co-Chair
Robyn Hederman, Co-Chair

March 2023

Contact

Elizabeth Kocienda, Director of Advocacy | 212.382.4788 | ekocienda@nycbar.org
Mary Margulis-Ohnuma, Policy Counsel | 212.382.6767 | mmargulis-ohnuma@nycbar.org

¹⁸ Katherine Blocksdorf, “Why Turnout Is Important for Your Horse,” *The Spruce Pets* (Aug. 17, 2022), <https://www.thesprucepets.com/importance-of-turnout-for-your-horse-1886932>; see also Nancy S. Loving, DVM, “Why Every Horse Needs Turnout Time,” *Horse Illustrated* (Apr. 2, 2019) (“Allowing a horse to live turned out with other horses for all or most of the day is best for physical health and well-being.”), <https://www.horseillustrated.com/why-every-horse-needs-turnout-time>

¹⁹ N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 17-330(g)(2).

²⁰ We also encourage the humane disposition of the horses, as horses are often sent to slaughter when they are deemed no longer valuable. See NYC Bar Association Animal Law Committee, Report Supporting the Creation of the Responsible Retirement of Racehorses Fund (July 09, 2021), https://s3.amazonaws.com/documents.nycbar.org/files/2017138-RacehorseFund_REISSUE.pdf; Report in Support of New York State Legislation Prohibiting the Slaughter of Horses for Human Consumption (Jun. 27, 2019), https://s3.amazonaws.com/documents.nycbar.org/files/20072932-HorseSlaughterBan_Animal_Report_FINAL_12.1.16.pdf.



NEW YORK
CITY BAR

EXHIBIT A

**Selected Incidents Involving New York City Horse-Drawn Carriages and Carriage Horses
(2006 - Present)²¹**

1. On November 18, 2022, an SUV struck a carriage and injured a horse on 58th Street near Ninth Avenue.²²
2. On June 14, 2022, a spooked horse galloped into traffic and collided with two cars. Wedged between the cars, the horse suffered a gash in the leg.²³
3. On August 10, 2022, an 87-degree day in New York City, a horse named Ryder collapsed in the middle of Ninth Avenue and 45th Street. The driver whipped the animal with reins and yelled “Get up! Get up!”²⁴ The horse was subsequently euthanized.²⁵
4. On September 23, 2021, a horse collided with a car in midtown, on its first day pulling a carriage.²⁶

²¹ This exhibit lists only incidents reported in media outlets targeting a general audience. Several other incidents are reported at NYCLASS, “Cruel and Inhumane Horse Drawn Carriages,” https://www.nyclass.org/horse_drawn_carriages and The Coalition for NYC Animals, “NYC Carriage Horse Accidents — The Harsh Truth — 115 Accidents — 27 Horse Deaths” (Aug. 13, 2022), <http://carriagehorsesnyc.blogspot.com/2018/09/nyc-carriage-horse-accidents-harsh.html>.

In addition, in October 2014 the New York City Police Department disclosed records relating to carriage horses, in response to a Freedom of Information Law request. The records revealed several accidents not covered by the media. *See* Letter from New York City Police Department, Office of Deputy Commissioner, to Christopher Wlach (Oct. 8, 2014), <https://d3n8a8pro7vhm.cloudfront.net/nyclass/pages/783/attachments/original/1414608919/Records2.pdf?1414608919>.

²² “SUV Driver Crashes into Horse Carriage in Manhattan,” CBS New York (Nov. 18, 2022), <https://www.cbsnews.com/newyork/news/suv-horse-carriage-crash-manhattan/>.

²³ Tina Moore and Natalie O’Neill, “NYC Carriage Horse Slams into Cars, Renews Calls to Ban the Practice,” *N.Y. Post* (Jun. 15, 2022), <https://nypost.com/2022/06/15/nyc-carriage-horse-slams-into-cars-renews-calls-for-ban/>.

²⁴ Elisha Fieldstadt, “Carriage Horse Collapses on Hot NYC Street as Driver Says, ‘Get Up! Get Up!’” *Today* (Aug. 11, 2022), <https://www.today.com/pets/pets/carriage-horse-collapses-nyc-renewing-bid-ban-practice-rcna42666>.

²⁵ Erica Brosnan, “NYC Carriage Horse Seen Collapsing in Viral Video Humanely Euthanized, Union Says,” *NY1* (Oct. 17, 2022), <https://www.ny1.com/nyc/all-boroughs/news/2022/10/17/ryder-the-carriage-horse-who-collapsed-in-manhattan-humanely-euthanized-union-says>.

²⁶ Ben Yakas, “Horse, on First Day of Pulling a Carriage, Injured After Colliding with Car in Midtown,” *Gothamist* (Sept. 24, 2021), <https://gothamist.com/news/horse-first-day-pulling-carriage-injured-after-colliding-car-midtown>.

5. On February 29, 2020 a 12-year-old mare named Aisha collapsed inside Central Park. She was euthanized a few hours later.²⁷
6. On October 2, 2018, a carriage horse collapsed in the middle of 59th Street.²⁸
7. On February 4, 2018, a horse spooked by an opening umbrella ran into two cars, injuring the carriage's passengers.²⁹
8. On February 21, 2017, a horse pulling a carriage collapsed inside Central Park.³⁰
9. On October 14, 2016, a horse-drawn carriage and pedicab collided.³¹
10. On September 5, 2016 — at 2 a.m. — a 14-year-old horse collapsed in the middle of the street.³²
11. On August 14, 2015, a carriage horse struck a teenage girl on a bicycle; the carriage then ran over her leg.³³
12. On October 19, 2014, a carriage horse ran away from its handlers up Eleventh Avenue until he was corralled by police.³⁴
13. On June 9, 2014, a carriage horse escaped from a driver and ran from 59th Street into Central Park before crashing into a taxi.³⁵

²⁷ Michael Gold, "An N.Y.C. Carriage Horse Died. Video of Its Collapse Stirred Outrage," *N.Y. Times* (Mar. 2, 2020), <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/02/nyregion/horse-carriage-collapse-nyc.html>.

²⁸ Katherine Sullivan, "VIDEO: Horse Pulling Carriage Collapses Amid Heavy NYC Traffic — When Will This Abuse End?", PETA (Nov. 30, 2022), <https://www.peta.org/blog/video-horse-pulling-carriage-collapses-amid-heavy-nyc-traffic/>.

²⁹ Khristina Narizhnaya and Emily Saul, "Horse Spooked by Umbrella Crashes into Cars, Injures Passengers," *N.Y. Post* (Feb. 4, 2018), <https://nypost.com/2018/02/04/horse-spooked-by-umbrella-crashes-into-cars-injures-passengers/>.

³⁰ Yoav Gonen, Kevin Sheehan, and Danika Fears, "Central Park Carriage Horse Collapses on the Job," *N.Y. Post* (Feb. 27, 2017), <https://nypost.com/2017/02/27/central-park-carriage-horse-collapses-on-the-job/>.

³¹ Danielle Furfaro and Danika Fears, "Pedicab Overturns After Accident With Horse-Drawn Carriage," *N.Y. Post* (Oct. 14, 2016), <https://nypost.com/2016/10/14/horse-drawn-carriage-overturns-in-central-park/>.

³² Zainab Akande, "Driver 'Screams' at Exhausted Carriage Horse Until He Collapses," *The Dodo* (Sept. 12, 2016), <https://www.thedodo.com/norman-carriage-horse-collapses-nyc-2003454970.html>.

³³ Ben Feuerherd and Shawn Cohen, "Teen on Bike Struck by Horse and Carriage in Central Park," *N.Y. Post* (Aug. 13, 2015), <http://nypost.com/2015/08/13/pedestrian-struck-by-horse-and-carriage-in-central-park/>.

³⁴ "Carriage Horse Gets Loose, Runs Through Streets of Manhattan," *ABC News* (Oct. 20, 2014), <https://abc13.com/horse-carriage-gets-loose/358624/>.

³⁵ Checkey Beckford, "Runaway Horse Bolts Through Central Park, Hits Taxi," *NBC New York* (Jun. 10, 2014), <https://www.nbcnewyork.com/news/local/horse-runs-away-crashes-taxi-central-park-new-york-city/2003004/>.

14. On April 23, 2014, a carriage horse overturned his carriage, causing the carriage to collapse on the horse.³⁶
15. In March 2014, a Freedom of Information Law request revealed that a carriage driver was accused of altering the hoof brand of his 22-year-old ailing horse, so that regulators would believe the horse to be a younger, healthier horse.³⁷
16. On December 18, 2013, a carriage driver was arrested for animal cruelty. According to the arresting officer, the driver had forced the horse to work for five hours, despite visible injuries and walking difficulties.³⁸
17. On September 26, 2013, a horse bolted through Columbus Circle, sideswiped a car, and overturned its carriage. The horse was pinned under the carriage and eventually freed by a group of bystanders.³⁹
18. On August 16, 2012, a carriage horse spooked by traffic broke free from a carriage and crashed into a parked car in Columbus Circle during rush hour before collapsing in the street, causing the carriage passengers and driver to “spill[] into the street” and sustain injuries to their legs, face and feet.⁴⁰
19. On December 4, 2011, a carriage horse pulling a carriage with three adults and a child collapsed at 59th Street and Fifth Avenue.⁴¹
20. On November 4, 2011, a carriage horse collapsed on West 60th Street near Broadway during rush hour.⁴²

³⁶ Jen Chung, “UPDATE: ‘Spooked’ Carriage Horse Collapses on Central Park South,” *Gothamist* (Apr. 24, 2014), <https://gothamist.com/news/update-spooked-carriage-horse-collapses-on-central-park-south>.

³⁷ David B. Caruso, “NYC Carriage Driver Accused in Horse Switch,” *Associated Press* (Apr. 29, 2014), <https://apnews.com/article/69859e995fc94e52b9ade3e3dd42716d>.

³⁸ Marc Santora, “Carriage Driver Is Charged With Animal Cruelty,” *N.Y. Times* (Dec. 20, 2013), <https://www.nytimes.com/2013/12/21/nyregion/carriage-horse-driver-is-charged-with-animal-cruelty.html>.

³⁹ Edgar Sandoval, Joe Kemp, and Bill Hutchinson, “Horse Flips Out in Midtown Manhattan Traffic, Carriage Breaks, Animal Gets Trapped Underneath,” *N.Y. Daily News* (Nov. 26, 2013), <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/carriage-horse-flips-midtown-traffic-article-1.1468477>.

⁴⁰ Matthew McNulty and Sarah Armaghan, “Carriage Horse Bucks Itself Free Near Central Park, Sends Driver, 2 Passengers Spilling into Street,” *N.Y. Daily News* (Aug. 16, 2012), <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/carriage-horse-bucks-free-sends-driver-passengers-spilling-street-article-1.1138092>.

⁴¹ Christopher Robbins, “Video: Carriage Horse Collapses as Busy Holiday Season Begins,” *Gothamist* (Dec. 5, 2011), <https://gothamist.com/news/video-carriage-horse-collapses-as-busy-holiday-season-begins>.

⁴² Kevin Deutsch, “Video of Horse Collapsing in Midtown New York Sparks Outcry from Activists for Carriage Ban,” *N.Y. Daily News* (Nov. 5, 2011), <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/video-horse-collapsing-midtown-new-york-sparks-outcry-activists-carriage-ban-article-1.972617>.

21. In October 2011, a horse collapsed and died as it left its stable for a day of work. According to the director of equine services for the ASPCA's Humane Law Enforcement department, the horse was "not healthy for a career in an urban carriage horse business."⁴³
22. On July 25, 2011, a taxi hit a horse-drawn carriage on Central Park South, injuring the driver, three passengers, and the horse. The buggy flipped to the side and one of the passengers was thrown to the sidewalk.⁴⁴
23. On November 3, 2010, a bus grazed a carriage horse on Seventh Avenue near 54th Street, spooking the horse.⁴⁵
24. On May 11, 2010, a horse carriage collided with a taxi in Central Park.⁴⁶
25. On May 1, 2010, a spooked carriage horse ran into oncoming traffic at Central Park South and Columbus Circle, sideswiping several cars before crashing.⁴⁷
26. On September 19, 2009, a taxi riding south on Fifth Avenue turned into Central Park and collided with a carriage and horse.⁴⁸
27. On September 14, 2007, a spooked horse ran onto the sidewalk and, hitched to its carriage, was trapped between two poles. Struggling to free itself, the horse collapsed to the ground and died. Another horse startled by the incident ran into traffic and crashed into a car.⁴⁹
28. On July 4, 2007, a spooked horse flipped over his carriage and collided with a taxi on Central Park South. A motorcyclist was also hit. One person was hospitalized and the horse suffered several gashes on its right hind leg.⁵⁰

⁴³ NBC New York, "Collapsed Carriage Horse Was Unhealthy, Necropsy Finds" (Nov. 1, 2011), <http://www.nbcnewyork.com/news/local/Charlie-Carriage-Horse-Necropsy-Ulcer-Health-ASPCA-133002288.html>.

⁴⁴ Kerry Wills, "Central Park Horse-Drawn Carriage Smacked by Taxi Cab, Four People Hurt," *N.Y. Daily News* (Jul. 26, 2011), <https://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/central-park-horse-drawn-carriage-smacked-taxi-cab-people-hurt-article-1.162487>.

⁴⁵ Ben Yakas, "Carriage Horse vs. Bus in Midtown," *Gothamist* (Nov. 6, 2010), <https://gothamist.com/news/carriage-horse-vs-bus-in-midtown>.

⁴⁶ Jen Carlson, "May Has Seen at Least Two Carriage Horse Crashes," *Gothamist* (May 13, 2010), <https://gothamist.com/news/may-has-seen-at-least-two-carriage-horse-crashes>.

⁴⁷ *Id.*

⁴⁸ Jen Carlson, "Cab Collides with Horse & Buggy on UES," *Gothamist* (Sept. 19, 2009), <https://gothamist.com/news/cab-collides-with-horse-buggy-on-ues>.

⁴⁹ Kerry Burke and Michael White, "Carriage Horse Dies After Tree Crash in Central Park," *N.Y. Daily News* (Sept. 15, 2007), <https://www.nydailynews.com/news/carriage-horse-dies-tree-crash-central-park-article-1.244815>.

⁵⁰ Erin Calabrese and Dan Kadison, "Horse and Taxi in Tale of Whoa," *N.Y. Post* (Jul. 5, 2007), <https://nypost.com/2007/07/05/horse-taxi-in-tale-of-whoa/>.

29. On April 28, 2006, a spooked horse ran into a 71-year-old bicyclist at 64th Street and Central Drive. The bicyclist and carriage driver were both hospitalized.⁵¹
30. On January 2, 2006, a spooked horse galloped down a street and crashed into a car at West 50th Street and Ninth Avenue.⁵² The carriage driver was thrown from the carriage and was hospitalized in a coma. The horse broke his leg and was euthanized.⁵³

⁵¹ Alison Gendar and Leo Standora, "Man Injured by Spooked Horse in Central Park," *N.Y. Daily News* (Apr. 29, 2006), <http://www.nydailynews.com/archives/news/man-injured-spooked-horse-central-park-article-1.627264>.

⁵² Carrie Melago, "Horse Bolts & Injures 3 in Midtown," *N.Y. Daily News* (Jan. 3, 2006).

⁵³ Nancy Dillon et al., "Carriage Driver in Coma; Wife Said He Was 'Scared' of Horse that Bolted in Midtown," *N.Y. Daily News* (Jan. 4, 2006), <http://www.nydailynews.com/archives/news/carriage-driver-coma-wife-scared-horse-bolted-midtown-article-1.555562>.