

**CONTACT**

ELIZABETH KOCIENDA  
ASSOCIATE DIRECTOR OF ADVOCACY  
212.382.4788 | ekocienda@nycbar.org

**REPORT ON LEGISLATION BY THE  
ANIMAL LAW COMMITTEE**

**Int. No. 0573-2014**

**Council Members Dromm, Rodriguez, Del Carmen Arroyo,  
Chin, Levine, Rosenthal, Cabrera.**

A LOCAL LAW to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to prohibiting the operation of horse-drawn cabs in the city of New York; and repealing certain provisions of such law relating thereto.

**THIS LEGISLATION IS APPROVED**

**SUMMARY OF THE PROPOSED LAW**

Int. No. 0573 amends the New York City Administrative Code (the “Code”) to prohibit the operation of horse-drawn carriages in New York City. Specifically, the proposed legislation amends sections 10-127, 17-326, 17-327, 17-329, 17-330, 17-332, 20-371, 20-372, 20-373, 20-374, 20-375, 20-378, and 20-379 to provide that (1) no new or existing applications for the operation of a horse-drawn carriage license will be valid after May 31, 2016; (2) the operation of horse-drawn carriages shall be unlawful as of June 1, 2016,<sup>1</sup> and (3) carriage horses licensed under section 17-327(d) shall not be sold for slaughter.<sup>2</sup>

Additionally, to offset the impact on those currently employed in the carriage horse industry, the proposed legislation would provide the following benefits to displaced workers: First, the proposed legislation creates a new section 20-384.1 under which the City will offer training to former horse drawn carriage drivers, owners and those employed in housing or maintaining carriage horses to transition displaced workers into a different industry. Next, the proposed legislation would cause the City to provide payment of the initial HAIL license fees<sup>3</sup> on behalf of persons or entities holding a horse drawn carriage driver’s license or a horse carriage license and who are eligible for a HAIL license.

---

<sup>1</sup> The proposed legislation makes an exception for the operation of horse-drawn carriages where a permit is obtained for such operation in a parade, special event or filming where the street or location of operation is closed to regular vehicular traffic and where the horses are transported by vehicle to and from the location.

<sup>2</sup> Existing law requires the “humane disposition” of carriage horses. N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 17-329. The proposed legislation would define that term to provide that “a horse may not be sold or donated to an individual or organization for purposes of slaughter, resale for slaughter, or holding or transport for slaughter.”

<sup>3</sup> Hail Accessible Inter-borough Licenses (“HAIL licenses”) are street hail livery licenses issuable under chapter 9 of the laws of 2012.

## LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

After three carriage horses died in a heat wave in 1988, the New York City Council enacted a local law regulating carriage horses “in order to minimize traffic congestion and to assure the health and safety of motorists and pedestrians. . . .”<sup>4</sup> In its legislative findings, the City Council noted that “[t]he presence of horse-drawn carriages in areas where there is traffic congestion jeopardizes the safety of the horses and increases the possibility of accidents.”<sup>5</sup> To address these problems, the City Council—voting 28 to 4 to override Mayor Koch’s veto—enacted Code provisions that, among other things: (1) regulate the time and place that carriage horses can be operated;<sup>6</sup> (2) require licensure of horses, carriages, and drivers;<sup>7</sup> (3) establish minimum standards for the treatment of horses;<sup>8</sup> and (4) require the establishment of an advisory board to make recommendations to the Commissioner of Health to promote the health, safety and well-being of the horses.<sup>9</sup> In 1994, the City Council amended the Code to lengthen the hours carriage horses were allowed to work and to enlarge the area in which horse-drawn carriages were allowed to operate.<sup>10</sup>

In April 2010, three years after the New York City Comptroller published a report critical of the City’s enforcement of the laws regulating the carriage-horse industry,<sup>11</sup> the City Council amended the Code to (1) require that stalls be at least 60 square feet (with a minimum width of seven feet and room for the horse to safely turn around and lie down within); (2) provide horses with a furlough of at least five non-consecutive weeks per year; (3) increase the minimum number of required veterinary examinations; (4) require that horses be between 5 and 26 years of age at the time they are placed into service or licensed to work; (5) increase the fee the industry may charge customers; (6) provide for a probationary horse-drawn carriage driver license; and (7) require additional carriage equipment.<sup>12</sup> The Committee opposed the 2010 Code amendments because, even though the local law sought to improve conditions, the amendments were not sufficient to significantly enhance the health, safety, and well-being of the carriage horses. Indeed, within a month of the local law’s passage, two accidents occurred in Manhattan and many other serious accidents have been reported since then.<sup>13</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup> Local Law No. 89-1989 § 1.

<sup>5</sup> *Id.*

<sup>6</sup> N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 20-381.1.

<sup>7</sup> N.Y.C. Admin. Code §§ 17-327 & 20-375.

<sup>8</sup> N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 17-330.

<sup>9</sup> N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 17-331.

<sup>10</sup> Local Law No. 2-1994.

<sup>11</sup> Audit Report on the Licensing and Oversight of the Carriage-Horse Industry by the Departments of Health and Mental Hygiene and Consumer Affairs (June 27, 2007), [http://www.comptroller.nyc.gov/bureaus/audit/PDF\\_FILES/MH07\\_092A.pdf](http://www.comptroller.nyc.gov/bureaus/audit/PDF_FILES/MH07_092A.pdf). All online sources cited in this report were last visited on October 27, 2015.

<sup>12</sup> Local Law No. 10-2010.

<sup>13</sup> Jen Carlson, *May Has Seen At Least Two Carriage Horse Crashes*, Gothamist.com (May 13, 2010), [http://gothamist.com/2010/05/13/carriage\\_horse\\_crash.php](http://gothamist.com/2010/05/13/carriage_horse_crash.php). See also Exhibit A attached hereto, listing accidents involving carriage horses in the City since 2006.

## THE COMMITTEE APPROVES THE PROPOSED LEGISLATION

For years, the Committee has advocated for an outright ban of carriage horse rides due to the dangerous and harsh conditions inherent in operating horse-drawn carriages in congested New York City streets and keeping horses in a crowded urban environment. We note that a number of cities in the United States and abroad prohibit horse-drawn carriages for this reason.<sup>14</sup>

### 1. Traffic Accidents

As explained above, the original local law was enacted in 1989 to address problems inherent in operating horse-drawn carriages in a congested urban environment. Since the 1989 enactment, traffic congestion has increased in severity—an average of more than 800,000 cars enter Manhattan via inbound bridges and tunnels daily.<sup>15</sup>

The Code has been ineffective in preventing a high incidence of accidents involving carriage horses. New York City has the highest carriage-horse accident rate in the United States.<sup>16</sup> As noted in Exhibit A, dozens of incidents involving carriage horses spooked by traffic have occurred, often resulting in injuries to the horse carriage passengers, as well as to bystanders, police officers and to the horses, and also resulting in damage to vehicles and other property. Unless horse-drawn carriages are banned from New York City streets, accidents will continue to occur, exposing humans and horses to danger.

### 2. Animal Welfare Concerns

In addition to the dangers presented to humans and horses, the horses' working conditions and living environment do not meet their essential needs and are therefore inhumane. As explained below, the existing law (1) fails to protect horses from the danger and stress inherent to working in a congested urban environment; (2) fails to afford carriage horses with the minimum voluntary stable size advocated by the Humane Society Veterinarian Medical Association; and (3) fails to provide carriage horses with the opportunity to graze or exercise unfettered by a harness. Furthermore, we note that in practice New York animal cruelty laws are rarely, if ever, enforced with respect to carriage horses.<sup>17</sup>

---

<sup>14</sup> See, e.g., Las Vegas, NV Municipal Code § 11.39.030, Pompano Beach, FL Code of Ordinances § 115.03 & Kenneth City, Florida, Code of Ordinances § 14-2; see also Reuven Weiss, Tel Aviv bans horse-drawn carriages, ynet.com (Nov. 8, 2009), <http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-3799424,00.html>; Horses Without Carriages International, "Cities That Have Banned The Carriage Horse Trade," <http://horseswithoutcarriages.org/bannedcarriages.shtml> (listing cities in Florida, Mississippi, Nevada, New Mexico, New Jersey, South Carolina, England, France, China, Canada, and India that have banned horse-drawn carriages)..

<sup>15</sup> New York City Department of Transportation, *2014 New York City Bridge Traffic Volumes* (published August 2015), <http://www.nyc.gov/html/dot/downloads/pdf/nyc-bridge-traffic-report-2014.pdf>.

<sup>16</sup> Kathy Stevens, *The New York City Carriage Horse Industry: A Response to Spokesperson Hansen*, The Huffington Post (Feb. 24, 2014), [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/kathy-stevens/new-york-carriage-horses\\_b\\_4824472.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/kathy-stevens/new-york-carriage-horses_b_4824472.html).

<sup>17</sup> See, e.g., *Carriage Driver Accused Of Forcing Injured Horse To Work*, CBS News (Dec. 21, 2013), <http://newyork.cbslocal.com/2013/12/21/carriage-driver-accused-of-forcing-injured-horse-to-work/>.

- a. Existing law fails to protect horses from the danger and stress inherent in working in a crowded urban environment.

At present, the City's carriage horses may be worked in busy city streets alongside cars, trucks, buses and other loud and dangerous urban sights and sounds for 9 hours per day, 7 days per week, in temperatures ranging from a low of 18 degrees to a high of 90 degrees Fahrenheit.<sup>18</sup> Carriage horses are forced to make a daily commute from their Hell's Kitchen stables to Central Park, in which they must endure fast-moving vehicles and honking horns. Once they arrive at Central Park South, the carriage horses may wait long hours standing in line for customers along a busy street devoid of shelter from the elements. In the summer, New York City's asphalt surfaces reach temperatures of 200 degrees Fahrenheit, which may lead to heat prostration; low temperatures and snow in winter are also dangerous to the horses.<sup>19</sup>

Equine experts and established animal protection organizations have opined that the environmental conditions in New York City are so detrimental to the horses' health and well-being, that carriage horses should be entirely banned from the City.<sup>20</sup>

- b. Existing law fails to afford carriage horses with the minimum voluntary stable size advocated by the national Humane Society Veterinarian Medical Association.

There are approximately 220 horses licensed by the City as carriage horses, and many are housed in windowless stalls in multi-story buildings in the Hell's Kitchen area of Manhattan.<sup>21</sup> Horses enter the building through ramps that connect the upper floor stall areas to the ground floor.<sup>22</sup> The stable stalls provided to the horses are significantly less than the size recommended by the national veterinarian associations.<sup>23</sup> The current law provides: "Standing stalls for carriage horses shall be sixty square feet or larger, with a minimum width of seven feet, and shall

---

<sup>18</sup> N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 17-330(o).

<sup>19</sup> See Dr. Holly Cheever, D.V.M., letter to Mayor Bloomberg and City Council re: Carriage Horse Abuse (Jan. 16, 2006), <http://www.banhdc.org/archives/ch-exp-letter.html>.

<sup>20</sup> The American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (ASPCA) has stated that "[n]either the New York City environment nor the current law can provide horses with the fundamental necessities to ensure their safety and well being." ASPCA Releases Findings on Carriage Horse Death (Oct. 31, 2011), <https://www.asPCA.org/about-us/press-releases/aspca-releases-findings-carriage-horse-death>. See also Cheever letter, *supra* (stating that there is "no way that cities with their exhaust fumes, hard road surfaces, and busy traffic patterns can provide a humane (as opposed to merely survivable) environment for a carriage horse."

<sup>21</sup> Matthew Kassel, *Inside A Stable Where Central Park's Carriage Horses Live*, Business Insider (April 6, 2012), <http://www.businessinsider.com/the-stables-where-central-park-carriage-horses-live-2012-4#>. See also *The New York City "Carriage-Horse Industry": An Animals' Angels Investigation* (March 2009), <http://www.animalsangels.org/files/images/stories/pdf/The%20Carriage%20Horses%20of%20New%20York%20City%20March%202009.pdf>.

<sup>22</sup> *The New York City "Carriage-Horse Industry": An Animals' Angels Investigation*. We note that such arrangements may impede prompt evacuation in the event of a fire or other emergency.

<sup>23</sup> Compare N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 17-330(c) (permitting stalls to be as small as 64 square feet) with the Humane Society Veterinary Medical Association's recommendation (recommending stalls to be 144 square feet to 196 square feet for draft horses).

be configured to permit a carriage horse to turn around and safely lay down within the stall.”<sup>24</sup> This is significantly less than the stable size advocated by the Humane Society Veterinary Medical Association, which recommends that stalls be a minimum of ten by ten feet and specifies that “twelve to fourteen foot square is better for the draft breeds.”<sup>25</sup>

- c. Existing law fails to provide horses with adequate opportunity to graze or exercise unfettered by a harness.

Existing law does not require that carriage horses receive adequate opportunity to graze or exercise unfettered by a harness. The Code provides that “[c]arriage horses shall receive no less than 5 non-consecutive weeks of vacation or furlough per year at a horse stable facility which allows daily access to paddock or pasture turnout.”<sup>26</sup> This requirement does not meet a horse’s need for regular turnout time in a safe pasture. “Turnout” means the practice of turning horses loose in a pasture, arena or corral for all or part of the day.<sup>27</sup>

Each horse should have—but rarely gets—daily turnout in order to satisfy natural behavioral and physical needs.<sup>28</sup> Regular turnout in a safe pasture is necessary for a horse’s health and well-being.<sup>29</sup> In at least one other jurisdiction, the law requires that horses be provided with turnout of at least two hours per day.<sup>30</sup>

## CONCLUSION

For the reasons explained above, the Committee approves Int. No. 0573.

Reissued November 2015<sup>31</sup>

---

<sup>24</sup> N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 17-330(c).

<sup>25</sup> Holly Cheever, DVM, *The Urban Carriage Horse Ride, A 21<sup>st</sup> Century Anachronism*, Humane Society Veterinary Medical Association (Feb. 19, 2014), [http://www.hsvma.org/the\\_urban\\_carriage\\_horse Ride#.ViqmU8vdsUR](http://www.hsvma.org/the_urban_carriage_horse Ride#.ViqmU8vdsUR).

<sup>26</sup> N.Y.C. Admin. Code § 17-330(g)(2).

<sup>27</sup> Dictionary of Horse Terms, Horse and Horse Information, <http://www.horses-and-horse-information.com/horsedictionary.shtml#t>; see also N.J. Admin. Code § 2:76-2A.10.

<sup>28</sup> Holly Cheever, DVM, *The Urban Carriage Horse Ride, A 21<sup>st</sup> Century Anachronism*, Humane Society Veterinary Medical Association (Feb. 19, 2014), [http://www.hsvma.org/the\\_urban\\_carriage\\_horse Ride#.ViqmU8vdsUR](http://www.hsvma.org/the_urban_carriage_horse Ride#.ViqmU8vdsUR).

<sup>29</sup> See, e.g., Nancy S. Loving, DVM, Colic: Updates and Prevention, TheHorse.com (Oct. 7, 2007) (daily turnout is the best strategy for avoiding colic), at <http://www.thehorse.com/ViewArticle.aspx?ID=10551>; Carolyn Heinze, The Grass is Not Always Greener, TheHorse.com (Mar. 1, 2004) (turnout helps horses avoid health problems and socialize), <http://www.thehorse.com/ViewArticle.aspx?ID=1217>.

<sup>30</sup> See Irene Stamatelakys, *Swiss Animal Protection Law Includes Horse Management Guidelines*, Horse.com (Oct. 24, 2008), <http://www.thehorse.com/ViewArticle.aspx?ID=12959>.

<sup>31</sup> Lori Barrett did not vote on or participate in the preparation of this report.

**EXHIBIT A**  
**Accidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages in New York City**  
**Documented Since 2006**

1. In August 2015, a 15 year old tourist was run over by a horse carriage while riding a bicycle in Central Park.<sup>32</sup>
2. In April 2015, a carriage horse named Fury escaped from his stable and bolted down 48th Street without a driver.<sup>33</sup>
3. In February 2015, a carriage horse named Tickle was killed after he broke his leg. The carriage industry has refused to disclose how he was fatally injured, despite public outcries and a public plea from Martha Stewart.<sup>34</sup>
4. In October 2014, newly obtained accident records from the NYPD showed that there have been at least 25 accidents that were previously unknown to the public, including at least a dozen hit-and-run incidents at the hands of carriage drivers.<sup>35</sup>
5. On October 19, 2014, a carriage horse escaped from handlers and ran against traffic on Eleventh Avenue until he was corralled by police.<sup>36</sup>
6. In June 2014, a carriage horse escaped from a driver and ran from 59<sup>th</sup> Street into Central Park before crashing into a taxi.<sup>37</sup>
7. In April 2014, a carriage horse was spooked as a bus drove by and overturned his carriage, causing the carriage to collapse on the horse.<sup>38</sup>
8. Records released in April 2014 by the New York City Police Department pursuant to a Freedom of Information request filed by the Animal Legal Defense Fund reflect over one dozen unreported “hit and run” incidents involving carriage horses between 2009 and 2013.<sup>39</sup>

---

<sup>32</sup> *Teen on Bike Struck by Horse and Carriage in Central Park*, New York Post (Aug. 13, 2015), <http://nypost.com/2015/08/13/pedestrian-struck-by-horse-and-carriage-in-central-park/>.

<sup>33</sup> *Cruel and Inhumane Horse Drawn Carriages*, NYCLASS, [http://www.nyclass.org/horse\\_drawn\\_carriages](http://www.nyclass.org/horse_drawn_carriages).

<sup>34</sup> *Central Park Carriage Horse Named Tickle Put Down After Mysterious Leg Injury*, New York Daily News (Feb. 23, 2015), <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/central-park-carriage-horse-put-leg-injury-article-1.2126852>.

<sup>35</sup> See, Letter from The City of New York Police Department, Office of Deputy Commissioner, to Christopher Wlach (Oct. 8, 2014), <https://d3n8a8pro7vhmx.cloudfront.net/nyclass/pages/783/attachments/original/1414608919/Records2.pdf?1414608919>.

<sup>36</sup> *CARRIAGE HORSE GETS LOOSE, RUNS THROUGH STREETS OF MANHATTAN*, ABC News (October 20, 2014), <http://abc13.com/news/watch-horse-gets-loose-runs-through-streets-of-manhattan/358624/>.

<sup>37</sup> *Runaway Horse Bolts Through Central Park, Hits Taxi*, NBC New York (June 10, 2014), <http://www.nbcnewyork.com/news/local/Horse-Runs-Away-Crashes-Taxi-Central-Park-New-York-City-262458391.html>.

<sup>38</sup> *UPDATE: ‘Spooked’ Carriage Horse Collapses On Central Park South*, Gothamist (April 24, 2014), [http://gothamist.com/2014/04/24/photo\\_spooked\\_carriage\\_horse\\_collap.php](http://gothamist.com/2014/04/24/photo_spooked_carriage_horse_collap.php).



9. On September 26, 2013, a carriage house became spooked and bolted through Columbus Circle, sideswiped a car and flipped the carriage. The carriage horse was pinned under the overturned carriage and eventually freed from the carriage by a group of bystanders. On the prior day, the carriage driver had been, among other things, charged with operating a carriage for more than 12 hours in a 20 hour period.<sup>40</sup>
10. On November 12, 2012, a carriage horse carrying a driver and three passengers fell inside Central Park at West 67<sup>th</sup> Street, sustaining injuries to his legs.<sup>41</sup>
11. On October 2, 2012, a carriage horse fell on West 41<sup>st</sup> Street and Eleventh Avenue, requiring the carriage to be pulled off of the horse and taking up two lanes of traffic.<sup>42</sup>
12. On August 16, 2012, a spooked carriage horse broke free from a carriage and crashed into a parked car in Columbus Circle during rush hour before collapsing in the street, causing the carriage passengers and driver to “spill[] into the street” and sustain injuries to their legs, face and feet.<sup>43</sup>
13. On December 5, 2011, a carriage horse pulling a carriage with three adults and a child collapsed at 59<sup>th</sup> Street and Fifth Avenue.<sup>44</sup>
14. On November 4, 2011, a carriage horse collapsed on West 60<sup>th</sup> Street near Broadway during rush hour.<sup>45</sup>
15. On October 23, 2011, a carriage horse collapsed and died on West 54<sup>th</sup> Street between Eighth and Ninth avenues. A necropsy performed on the horse indicated that the 15 year old horse was suffering from a fractured tooth and a painful stomach ulcer.<sup>46</sup>

---

<sup>39</sup> Stephen Wells, *Legally Brief: Traffic Reports Finally Released in Horse Carriage Accidents*, Animal Legal Defense Fund (November 20, 2014), <http://aldf.org/blog/legally-brief-traffic-reports-finally-released-in-horse-carriage-accidents/>.

<sup>40</sup> Edgar Sandoval, Joe Kemp, and Bill Hutchinson, *Horse flips out in midtown Manhattan traffic, carriage breaks, animal gets trapped underneath*, NY DAILY NEWS (November 26, 2013), <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/carriage-horse-flips-midtown-traffic-article-1.1468477>.

<sup>41</sup> *15th Horse Carriage Accident in Manhattan this Year*, NYCLASS (November 12, 2012), [http://www.nyclass.org/15th\\_horse\\_carriage\\_accident\\_in\\_manhattan\\_this\\_year](http://www.nyclass.org/15th_horse_carriage_accident_in_manhattan_this_year).

<sup>42</sup> *14th Horse Carriage Accident in Midtown this Year*, NYCLASS (October 2, 2012), [http://www.nyclass.org/press\\_advisory\\_14th\\_horse\\_carriage\\_accident\\_in\\_midtown\\_this\\_year](http://www.nyclass.org/press_advisory_14th_horse_carriage_accident_in_midtown_this_year).

<sup>43</sup> Matthew McNulty and Sarah Armaghan, *Carriage horse bucks itself free near Central Park, sends driver, 2 passengers spilling into street*, NY DAILY NEWS (AUGUST 16, 2012), <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/carriage-horse-bucks-free-sends-driver-passengers-spilling-street-article-1.1138092>.

<sup>44</sup> Christopher Robbins, *Carriage Horse Collapses As Busy Holiday Season Begins*, Gothamist.com (December 5, 2011), [http://gothamist.com/2011/12/05/video\\_carriage\\_horse\\_collapses\\_as\\_b.php](http://gothamist.com/2011/12/05/video_carriage_horse_collapses_as_b.php).

<sup>45</sup> Kevin Deutsch, *Video of horse collapsing in midtown New York sparks outcry from activists for carriage ban*, NY DAILY NEWS (November 5, 2011), <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/video-horse-collapsing-midtown-new-york-sparks-outcry-activists-carriage-ban-article-1.972617>.

<sup>46</sup> *Collapsed Carriage Horse Was Unhealthy, Necropsy Finds*, NBC New York (November 1, 2011), <http://www.nbcnewyork.com/news/local/Charlie-Carriage-Horse-Necropsy-Ulcer-Health-ASPCA-133002288.html>.

16. On July 26, 2011, a taxi hit a horse-drawn carriage on Central Park South, injuring the driver, three passengers, and the horse. The buggy flipped to the side and one of the passengers was thrown to the sidewalk.<sup>47</sup>
17. On July 16, 2011, a spooked carriage horse bolted from Grand Army Plaza and Fifth Avenue up Central Park South to Seventh Avenue, hitting a taxi and a car.<sup>48</sup>
18. On November 3, 2010, a bus grazed a carriage horse on Seventh Avenue near 54<sup>th</sup> Street. A witness stated that the horse "was spooked and evidently frightened out of his or her wits."<sup>49</sup>
19. On May 11, 2010, a carriage horse collided with a taxi in Central Park.<sup>50</sup>
20. On May 1, 2010, a carriage horse was spooked and ran into oncoming traffic in Columbus Circle, sideswiping cars as he ran pulling a carriage.<sup>51</sup>
21. In November 2009, a child was run over by the wheel of a horse carriage after falling from the carriage, suffering stomach, chest and head injuries.<sup>52</sup>
22. On September 19, 2009, a taxi going south on Fifth Avenue turned into Central Park and plowed into a carriage horse buggy, knocking the buggy over and smashing it.<sup>53</sup>
23. On August 31, 2008, two carriage horses were spooked while pulling a wedding carriage in Bensonhurst, Brooklyn and took off into traffic, smashing into a car stopped at a red light and injuring the carriage driver.<sup>54</sup>
24. On September 14, 2007, a spooked horse reared up and turned its carriage over, charging a tree and another carriage. This sent a second horse running against traffic and plowing into a Mercedes-Benz. The horse died on the pavement near Center Drive in Central Park.<sup>55</sup>

---

<sup>47</sup> Kerry Wills, *Central Park horse-drawn carriage smacked by taxi cab, four people hurt*, NY DAILY NEWS (July 26, 2011), [http://www.nydailynews.com/ny\\_local/2011/07/26/2011-07-26\\_central\\_park\\_horsedrawn\\_carriage\\_smacked\\_by\\_taxi\\_cab\\_four\\_people\\_hurt.html](http://www.nydailynews.com/ny_local/2011/07/26/2011-07-26_central_park_horsedrawn_carriage_smacked_by_taxi_cab_four_people_hurt.html).

<sup>48</sup> Coalition to Ban Horse-Drawn Carriages Newsletter (July 17, 2011), <http://archive.constantcontact.com/fs054/1101376025369/archive/1106535174196.html>.

<sup>49</sup> Ben Yakas, *Carriage Horse vs. Bus in Midtown*, Gothamist.com (Nov. 6, 2010), [http://gothamist.com/2010/11/06/carriage\\_horse\\_vs\\_bus\\_the\\_neverendi.php](http://gothamist.com/2010/11/06/carriage_horse_vs_bus_the_neverendi.php).

<sup>50</sup> Jen Carlson, *May Has Seen At Least Two Carriage Horse Crashes*, Gothamist.com (May 13, 2010), [http://gothamist.com/2010/05/13/carriage\\_horse\\_crash.php](http://gothamist.com/2010/05/13/carriage_horse_crash.php).

<sup>51</sup> *Two Carriage Horse Accidents Just Days After NYC Mayor Signs Industry Bill*, Animal Law Coalition Web Page (May 16, 2010), at <http://www.animallawcoalition.com/animal-cruelty/article/278>.

<sup>52</sup> NYPD Aided Report # 00419, <http://aldf.org/wp-content/uploads/manual/NYPD-records-posted-11-20-2014.zip>.

<sup>53</sup> Jen Carlson, *Cab Collides With Horse & Buggy on UES*, Gothamist.com (Sept. 19, 2009); [http://gothamist.com/2009/09/19/horse\\_buggy\\_struck\\_on\\_ues.php#photo-1](http://gothamist.com/2009/09/19/horse_buggy_struck_on_ues.php#photo-1).

<sup>54</sup> Simone Weichselbaum, *Workhorses get treatment after wedding carriage crash*, NY DAILY NEWS (Sept. 2, 2008), <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/brooklyn/workhorses-treatment-wedding-carriage-crash-article-1.321254>.



25. On July 3, 2007, a spooked horse flipped over his carriage and collided with a taxi on Central Park South. A motorcyclist and a bike were hit with the carriage. One person was hospitalized and the horse suffered several gashes on its right hind leg.<sup>56</sup>
26. On June 2, 2007, a spooked horse galloped into traffic still attached to his carriage. An SUV struck the horse at 54<sup>th</sup> Street and Seventh Avenue and the horse fell to the pavement.<sup>57</sup>
27. On April 13, 2007, a taxi crashed into a carriage while a horse was working.<sup>58</sup>
28. On May 5, 2006, a spooked horse ran through the street narrowly missing several cars before colliding with and overturning a moving car. The driver of the car was hospitalized and witnesses observed a gash on the horse's neck.<sup>59</sup>
29. On April 28, 2006, a spooked horse ran into a 71-year-old bicyclist at 64<sup>th</sup> Street and Central Drive. The bicyclist and horse-carriage driver were both hospitalized.<sup>60</sup>
30. On January 2, 2006, a spooked horse bolted down a street crashing into a station wagon at 50<sup>th</sup> Street and Ninth Avenue.<sup>61</sup> The drivers of the car were seriously injured and the carriage driver was hospitalized after being ejected from the carriage. The horse was pinned down under the car and he had to be euthanized the next day.<sup>62</sup>

---

<sup>55</sup> Kerry Burke and Michael White, *Carriage horse dies after tree crash in Central Park*, NY DAILY NEWS (Sept. 15, 2007), [http://www.nydailynews.com/news/2007/09/15/2007-09-15\\_carriage\\_horse\\_dies\\_after\\_tree\\_crash\\_nea.html](http://www.nydailynews.com/news/2007/09/15/2007-09-15_carriage_horse_dies_after_tree_crash_nea.html).

<sup>56</sup> Erin Calabrese and Dan Kadison, *Horse and Taxi in Tale of Whoa*, NY POST (July 5, 2007).

<sup>57</sup> Coalition to Ban Horse-drawn Carriages Web site, <http://www.banhdc.org/archives/ch-acc-20070602.html>.

<sup>58</sup> *Id.*, <http://www.banhdc.org/archives/ch-acc-20070413.html>.

<sup>59</sup> Associated Press, *Horse and Buggy Strike Car in Manhattan. No Serious Injuries* (May 5, 2006), <http://www.banhdc.org/archives/ch-media-20050505.html>.

<sup>60</sup> Alison Gendar and Leo Standora, *Man Injured by Spooked Horse in Central Park*, NY DAILY NEWS (Apr. 29, 2006), <http://www.nydailynews.com/archives/news/man-injured-spooked-horse-central-park-article-1.627264>.

<sup>61</sup> Carrie Melago, *Horse Bolts & Injures 3 in Midtown*, NY DAILY NEWS (Jan. 3, 2006).

<sup>62</sup> Dillon et al., *Carriage Driver in Coma*, NY DAILY NEWS (Jan. 4, 2006), <http://www.nydailynews.com/archives/news/carriage-driver-coma-wife-scared-horse-bolted-midtown-article-1.555562>.