



**NEW YORK  
CITY BAR**

Contact: Maria Cilenti - Director of Legislative Affairs - mcilenti@nycbar.org - (212) 382-6655

**REPORT ON LEGISLATION BY THE  
ANIMAL LAW COMMITTEE**

**A.997  
S.667**

**M. of A. Rosenthal  
Sen. Avella**

AN ACT to amend the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to prohibiting the operation of horse drawn cabs in the city of New York; and repealing certain provisions of such law relating thereto.

**THIS LEGISLATION IS APPROVED**

**1. Summary of the Proposed Law**

A.997/S.667 (the “Bill”) amends the New York City Administrative Code (the “Code”) to prohibit the operation of horse-drawn carriages in New York City. Specifically, the bill adds a new section 17-326.1 to the Code that provides: “It shall be unlawful to offer rides to the public on a vehicle drawn or pulled by a carriage horse.” The bill amends section 17-239 of the Code to provide that a carriage-horse owner may transfer a carriage horse only if the transferee signs an assurance that the horse shall not be sold or put to work, and will be kept solely as a companion animal and treated humanely for the remainder of the horse’s natural life. The bill also makes several technical amendments to the Code to repeal provisions applicable to the operation of horse-drawn carriages.

The Animal Law Committee of the New York City Bar Association (the “Committee”) supports the Bill and urges its enactment.

**2. Legislative History**

After three carriage horses died in a heat wave in 1988, the New York City Council enacted a local law regulating carriage horses “in order to minimize traffic congestion and to assure the health and safety of motorists and pedestrians. . . .”<sup>1</sup> In its legislative findings, the City Council noted that “[t]he presence of horse drawn carriages in areas where there is traffic congestion jeopardizes the safety of the horses and increases the possibility of accidents.”<sup>2</sup> To address these problems, the City Council—voting 28 to 4 to override Mayor Koch’s veto—enacted Code provisions that, among other things: (1) regulate the time and place that carriage horses can be operated;<sup>3</sup> (2) require licensure of horses, carriages, and

---

<sup>1</sup> Local Law No. 89-1989 § 1.

<sup>2</sup> *Id.*

<sup>3</sup> Code § 20-381.1.

drivers;<sup>4</sup> (3) establish minimum standards for the treatment of horses;<sup>5</sup> and (4) require the establishment of an advisory board to make recommendations to the Commissioner of Health to promote the health, safety and well-being of the horses.<sup>6</sup> In 1994, the City Council amended the Code to lengthen the hours carriage horses were allowed to work and enlarge the area in which horse-drawn carriages were allowed to operate.<sup>7</sup>

In April 2010, three years after the New York City Comptroller published a report critical of the City's enforcement of the laws regulating the carriage-horse industry,<sup>8</sup> the City Council amended the Code to (1) require that stalls be at least 64 square feet; (2) provide horses with a furlough at least five non-consecutive weeks per year; (3) increase the minimum number of required veterinary examinations; (4) require that horses be between five and twenty-six years of age; (5) increase the fee the industry may charge customers; (6) provide for a probationary horse-drawn carriage driver license; and (7) require additional carriage equipment.<sup>9</sup> The Committee opposed the 2010 Code amendments because, even though the local law apparently sought to improve conditions, the amendments were not adequate to significantly promote the health, safety and well-being of the carriage horses. In fact, within a month of the local law's passage, two accidents involving carriage horses occurred in Manhattan and a number of other serious accidents have occurred since that time.<sup>10</sup>

### 3. The Committee Approves the Bill

For years, the Committee has advocated for an outright ban of carriage horse rides due to the dangerous and harsh conditions inherent in operating horse-drawn carriages in congested New York City streets and keeping horses in a crowded urban environment.<sup>11</sup> We approve A.997/S.667 because it

---

<sup>4</sup> Code §§ 17-327 & 20-375.

<sup>5</sup> Code § 17-330.

<sup>6</sup> Code § 17-331.

<sup>7</sup> Local Law No. 2-1994.

<sup>8</sup> Audit Report on the Licensing and Oversight of the Carriage-Horse Industry by the Departments of Health and Mental Hygiene and Consumer Affairs (June 27, 2007), available at [http://www.comptroller.nyc.gov/bureaus/audit/PDF\\_FILES/MH07\\_092A.pdf](http://www.comptroller.nyc.gov/bureaus/audit/PDF_FILES/MH07_092A.pdf). (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>9</sup> Local Law No. 10-2010.

<sup>10</sup> Jen Carlson, *May Has Seen At Least Two Carriage Horse Crashes*, Gothamist.com (May 13, 2010), at [http://gothamist.com/2010/05/13/carriage\\_horse\\_crash.php](http://gothamist.com/2010/05/13/carriage_horse_crash.php). (Last visited January 31, 2013.); see also Exhibit A attached hereto.

<sup>11</sup> The following reports and testimony concerning the regulation of horse-drawn carriages in New York City are available on the New York City Bar Web site:

- Report opposing New York City Introduction No. 35-2010 -- <http://www.nycbar.org/pdf/report/uploads/20071913-CommentonIntro35reHorseDrawnCabs.pdf>;
- Report approving New York City Introduction No. 86-2010 -- <http://www.nycbar.org/pdf/report/uploads/20071886-CommentinIntro86reHourseDrawnCarriages.pdf>;
- Testimony on behalf of the Committee on Legal Issues Pertaining to Animals regarding Introduction Nos. 35-2010 and 86-2010 -- <http://www.nycbar.org/pdf/report/uploads/20071887-TestimonyreIntro35and86CarriageHorses.pdf>;

will prohibit horse-drawn carriages in New York City and require that the horses be treated as non-working companion animals for the remainder of their lives.

a. Traffic Accidents

As explained above, the original local law was enacted in 1989 in order to address problems inherent in operating horse-drawn carriages in a congested urban environment. Since local legislation was enacted in 1989, the problem of traffic congestion has increased in severity—more than 800,000 cars enter Manhattan beneath 60<sup>th</sup> Street each weekday.<sup>12</sup> Consequently, the Code has been ineffective in preventing a high incidence of accidents involving carriage horses.

New York City has the highest carriage-horse accident rate in the United States, according to a report in *Newsweek*.<sup>13</sup> In July 2011 alone, two accidents occurred—in one of them, a buggy was overturned, injuring the passengers, driver, and horse.<sup>14</sup> Similarly in 2012, at least three accidents occurred, one of which resulted in significant injuries to the carriage horse passengers. (A list of accidents documented on-line in news reports and by animal-advocacy organizations in the past five years is attached to this report as Exhibit A.) Unless horse-drawn carriages are barred from New York City streets, accidents will undoubtedly continue to occur, exposing humans and horses to danger. Several cities in the United States and abroad prohibit horse-drawn carriages.<sup>15</sup>

b. Animal Welfare Concerns

In addition to the dangers presented to humans, the working conditions and the horses' living environment do not meet the carriage horses' essential needs. Among other things, existing law fails to: protect horses from the stress inherent in working in a crowded urban environment, afford carriage

- 
- Report approving New York City Introduction No. 658-2007 -- <http://www.nycbar.org/pdf/report/Carriage%20Horses%20Ban%2013.pdf>;
  - Testimony on behalf of the Committee on Legal Issues Pertaining to Animals regarding Introduction No. 658-A-2007 -- <http://www.nycbar.org/pdf/report/TestimonyCarriageBill.pdf>;
  - Report opposing New York City Introduction No. 653-A-2007 -- <http://www.nycbar.org/pdf/report/Comment653a.pdf>; and
  - Report approving New York City Introduction No. 44-2006 -- <http://www.nycbar.org/pdf/report/CarriageHorses.pdf>.

<sup>12</sup> Regional Plan Association, *Congestion Pricing in New York City: Making the Case* (Nov. 21, 2003), available at <http://www.rpa.org/2003/11/spotlight-vol-2-no-22-congestion-pricing-in-new-york-city-making-the-case.html>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>13</sup> Jessica Bennett, *Tradition or Cruelty*, *Newsweek.com* (Sept. 25, 2007), at <http://www.newsweek.com/2007/09/24/tradition-or-cruelty.html>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>14</sup> Kerry Wills, *Central Park horse-drawn carriage smacked by taxi cab, four people hurt*, *NY DAILY NEWS* (July 26, 2011), available at [http://www.nydailynews.com/ny\\_local/2011/07/26/2011-07-26\\_central\\_park\\_horsedrawn\\_carriage\\_smacked\\_by\\_taxi\\_cab\\_four\\_people\\_hurt.html?r=ny\\_local&utm\\_source=feedburner&utm\\_medium=feed&utm\\_campaign=Feed%3A+nydnrss%2Fny\\_local+%28NY+Local%29](http://www.nydailynews.com/ny_local/2011/07/26/2011-07-26_central_park_horsedrawn_carriage_smacked_by_taxi_cab_four_people_hurt.html?r=ny_local&utm_source=feedburner&utm_medium=feed&utm_campaign=Feed%3A+nydnrss%2Fny_local+%28NY+Local%29). (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>15</sup> See, e.g., Las Vegas, NV Municipal Code § 11.39.030, Pompano Beach, FL Code of Ordinances § 115.03 & Kenneth City, Florida, Code of Ordinances § 14-2; see also Reuven Weiss, *Tel Aviv bans horse-drawn carriages*, *ynet.com* (Nov. 8, 2009), at <http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-3799424,00.html>. (last visited January 31, 2013.)

horses with the minimum voluntary stable size advocated by the New York State Department of Agriculture's Horse Health Assurance Program, and provide horses with daily turnout time in a pasture.

- i. *Existing law fails to protect horses from the stress inherent in working in a crowded urban environment.*

The ASPCA, the primary enforcer of the laws relating to carriage horses, has opined that the environmental conditions in New York City are so detrimental to the horses' health and well being, that carriage horses should be entirely banned from the City.<sup>16</sup> The ASPCA stated, "Neither the New York City environment nor the current law can provide horses with the fundamental necessities to ensure their safety and well being."<sup>17</sup> Harvard- and Cornell-trained equine veterinarian Holly Cheever opined that there is "no way that cities with their exhaust fumes, hard road surfaces, and busy traffic patterns can provide a humane (as opposed to merely survivable) environment for a carriage horse."<sup>18</sup> In the summer, New York City's asphalt surfaces reach temperatures of 200 degrees, which makes keeping horses sufficiently cool impossible, according to Dr. Cheever.<sup>19</sup> Low temperatures and snow in winter are also dangerous to the horses.<sup>20</sup>

- ii. *Existing law fails to afford carriage horses with the minimum voluntary stable size advocated by the New York State Department of Agriculture's Horse Health Assurance Program.*

The minimum stable size is less than half the size recommended by the state. The Code provides: "Standing stalls in stables shall be sixty four square feet or larger, with a minimum width of seven feet, and shall be configured to permit a horse to turn around and safely lay down within the stall."<sup>21</sup> This is less than half the stable size required by the New York State Department of Agriculture and Markets Horse Health Assurance Program. ("NYSHHAP"). NYSHHAP is a voluntary certification program that requires compliance with best practices developed by equine veterinarians and staff of the Department of Agriculture and Markets' Division of Animal Industry.<sup>22</sup> The New York City Police Department Mounted Units A, B, D, E, and F are members of NYSHHAP. The NYSHHAP Standards require that

---

<sup>16</sup> ASPCA Web page, New York City Carriage Horses, at <http://www.asPCA.org/fight-animal-cruelty/animal-precinct/nyc-carriage-horse-industry.aspx>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>17</sup> *Id.*

<sup>18</sup> Holly Cheever letter to Mayor Bloomberg and City Council re: Carriage Horse Abuse (Jan. 16, 2006), available at <http://www.banhdc.org/archives/ch-exp-letter.html>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>19</sup> *Id.*

<sup>20</sup> *Id.*

<sup>21</sup> Code § 17-330(c).

<sup>22</sup> The best practices are contained in the NYSHHAP Standards and Certification Manual ("referred to hereinafter as "NYSHHAP Standards"), available upon request from NYSHHAP Coordinator Dr. Lyda W. Denney at [lyda.denney@agmkt.state.ny.us](mailto:lyda.denney@agmkt.state.ny.us).

stalls be about 12 feet by 12 feet (144 square feet) for mid-sized horses and 14 feet by 14 feet (196 square feet) for draft horses and large warmbloods.<sup>23</sup>

iii. *Existing law fails to provide horses with daily turnout time in a pasture.*

The Code provides, “Carriage horses shall receive no less than five non-consecutive weeks of vacation or furlough per year at a horse stable facility which allows daily access to paddock or pasture turnout.”<sup>24</sup> This requirement does not meet a horse’s need for regular turnout time in a safe pasture. “Turnout” means the practice of turning horses loose in a pasture, arena or corral for all or part of the day.<sup>25</sup>

The NYSHHAP Standards assume that horses will be provided with regular turnout time in a safe pasture of adequate size.<sup>26</sup> Pasture facilities must be safe and appropriate and vegetation must be properly maintained.<sup>27</sup> Regular turnout in a safe pasture is necessary for a horse’s health and well being.<sup>28</sup> In at least one other jurisdiction, the law requires that horses be provided with turnout of at least two hours per day.<sup>29</sup> The Code falls short of meeting this essential requirement and allows only a few weeks of rest per year during which there is no requirement that a horse be provided with turnout time

#### **4. Local Support for a Ban on Horse-Drawn Carriages**

Over 50 animal advocacy and local organizations support a ban on horse-drawn carriages in New York City.<sup>30</sup> Among them are the Shubert Organization (owner of several Broadway theatres),<sup>31</sup> the

---

<sup>23</sup> NYSHHAP Standards at 34.

<sup>24</sup> Code § 17-330(g)(2).

<sup>25</sup> Dictionary of Horse Terms, Horse and Horse Information Web page at <http://www.horses-and-horse-information.com/horsedictionary.shtml#t>; see also New Jersey Administrative Code § 2:76-2A.10. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>26</sup> NYSHHAP Standards at 43; see also Lyda W. Denney, NYSHHAP Equine “Fast Facts” Series 5 (May 2009).

<sup>27</sup> NYSHHAP Standards at 43.

<sup>28</sup> E.g., Nancy S. Loving, DVM, *Colic: Updates and Prevention*, TheHorse.com (Oct. 7, 2007) (daily turnout is the best strategy for avoiding colic), at <http://www.thehorse.com/ViewArticle.aspx?ID=10551> (last visited January 31, 2013); Carolyn Heinze, *The Grass is Not Always Greener*, TheHorse.com (Mar. 1, 2004) (turnout helps horses avoid health problems and socialize), at <http://www.thehorse.com/ViewArticle.aspx?ID=1217>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>29</sup> Irene Stamatelakys, *Swiss Animal Protection Law Includes Horse Management Guidelines*, Horse.com (Oct. 24, 2008), at <http://www.thehorse.com/ViewArticle.aspx?ID=12959>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>30</sup> Many such organizations are listed on the Web site of the Coalition to Ban Horse-Drawn Carriages, at <http://www.banhdc.org/organizations.shtml>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>31</sup> NYCLASS Web Page, Supporters, at <http://www.ny-class.org/about/supporters>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

ASPCA,<sup>32</sup> the Humane Society of the United States,<sup>33</sup> and PETA.<sup>34</sup> Numerous prominent New York City community members also support the ban.<sup>35</sup>

The New York City Horse and Carriage Association, NYC & Company, and individual carriage horse owners and drivers oppose the ban, arguing a ban on carriage-horses will cost jobs and may make New York City a less-attractive destination for tourists.

A proposed local law, Introduction No. 86-2010, would address such concerns by establishing a new “show car” licensing program. Under the program, fully electric, vintage-replica vehicles would be registered by the City and driven by drivers regulated by the City. The legislation gives horse-carriage licensees priority in applying for such licenses. The eco-friendly replicas of cars from the early 1900's have the potential to increase revenue for the City and encourage tourism without the exploitation of animals. Accordingly, the objections cited above, even if meritorious, would be addressed by the passage of Introduction No. 86-2010 or comparable legislation.

## 5. Summary

For the reasons explained above, the Committee approves A.997/S.667.

Reissued February 2013

---

<sup>32</sup> ASPCA Web page, New York City Carriage Horses, at <http://www.asPCA.org/fight-animal-cruelty/animal-precinct/nyc-carriage-horse-industry.aspx>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>33</sup> Humane Society of the United States Web page, *Treatment of New York City Carriage Horses not Trotting toward Improvement* (April 15, 2010), at [http://www.humanesociety.org/news/press\\_releases/2010/04/new\\_york\\_carriage\\_horses\\_041510.html](http://www.humanesociety.org/news/press_releases/2010/04/new_york_carriage_horses_041510.html). (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>34</sup> PETA Web page, Lea Michele Exposes Horse-Drawn Carriage Cruelty, at <http://www.peta.org/features/lea-michele-horse-drawn-carriage-expose.aspx>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>35</sup> NYCLASS Web Page, Supporters, at <http://www.ny-class.org/about/supporters>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

## EXHIBIT A

### **Accidents Involving Horse-Drawn Carriages in New York City Documented Since 2006**

1. On November 12, 2012 a carriage horse carrying a driver and three passengers fell inside Central Park at West 67<sup>th</sup> Street, sustaining injuries to his legs.<sup>36</sup>
2. On October 2, 2012 a carriage horse fell on West 41<sup>st</sup> Street and Eleventh Avenue, requiring the carriage to be pulled off of the horse and taking up two lanes of traffic.<sup>37</sup>
3. On August 16, 2012 a spooked carriage horse broke free from a carriage and crashed into a parked car in Columbus Circle during rush hour before collapsing in the street, causing the carriage passengers and driver to “spill[] into the street” and sustain injuries to their legs, face and feet.<sup>38</sup>
4. On December 5, 2011 a carriage horse pulling a carriage with three adults and a child collapsed at 59<sup>th</sup> Street and Fifth Avenue.<sup>39</sup>
5. On November 4, 2011 a carriage horse collapsed on West 60<sup>th</sup> Street near Broadway during rush hour.<sup>40</sup>
6. On October 23, 2011 a carriage horse collapsed and died on West 54<sup>th</sup> Street between Eighth and Ninth avenues. A necropsy performed on the horse indicated that the 15 year old horse was suffering from a fractured tooth and a painful stomach ulcer.<sup>41</sup>

---

<sup>36</sup> *15<sup>th</sup> Horse Carriage Accident in Manhattan this Year*, NYCLASS (November 12, 2012), available at <http://www.nyclass.org/taxonomy/term/1> (Last visited February 1, 2013).

<sup>37</sup> *14<sup>th</sup> Horse Carriage Accident in Midtown this Year*, NYCLASS (October 2, 2012), available at <http://www.nyclass.org/node/1694> (Last visited February 1, 2013).

<sup>38</sup> Matthew McNulty and Sarah Armaghan, *Carriage horse bucks itself free near Central Park, sends driver, 2 passengers spilling into street*, NY DAILY NEWS (AUGUST 16, 2012), available at <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/carriage-horse-bucks-free-sends-driver-passengers-spilling-street-article-1.1138092> (Last visited February 1, 2013).

<sup>39</sup> Christopher Robbins, *Carriage Horse Collapses As Busy Holiday Season Begins*, Gothamist.com (December 5, 2011), available at [http://gothamist.com/2011/12/05/video\\_carriage\\_horse\\_collapses\\_as\\_b.php](http://gothamist.com/2011/12/05/video_carriage_horse_collapses_as_b.php) (Last visited February 1, 2013).

<sup>40</sup> Kevin Deutsch, *Video of horse collapsing in midtown New York sparks outcry from activists for carriage ban*, NY DAILY NEWS (November 5, 2011), available at [http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/video-horse-collapsing-midtown-new-york-sparks-outcry-activists-carriage-ban-article-1.972617?utm\\_medium=feed&utm\\_campaign=Feed%3A+nydnrss%2Fnews+%28News%29&utm\\_source=feedburner&localLinksEnabled=false](http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/video-horse-collapsing-midtown-new-york-sparks-outcry-activists-carriage-ban-article-1.972617?utm_medium=feed&utm_campaign=Feed%3A+nydnrss%2Fnews+%28News%29&utm_source=feedburner&localLinksEnabled=false) (Last visited February 1, 2013).

<sup>41</sup> *Collapsed Carriage Horse Was Unhealthy, Necropsy Find*, NBC New York (November 1, 2011), available at <http://www.nbcnewyork.com/news/local/Charlie-Carriage-Horse-Necropsy-Ulcer-Health-ASPCA-133002288.html> (Last visited February 1, 2013).



7. On July 26, 2011, a taxi hit a horse-drawn carriage on Central Park South, injuring the driver, three passengers, and the horse. The buggy flipped to the side and one of the passengers was thrown to the sidewalk.<sup>42</sup>
8. On July 16, 2011, a spooked carriage horse bolted from Grand Army Plaza and Fifth Avenue up Central Park South to 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue, hitting a taxi and a car.<sup>43</sup>
9. On November 3, 2010, a bus grazed a carriage horse on 7th Avenue near 54th street. A witness stated that the horse "was spooked and evidently frightened out of his or her wits."<sup>44</sup>
10. On May 11, 2010, a carriage horse collided with a taxi in Central Park.<sup>45</sup>
11. On May 1, 2010 a carriage horse was spooked and ran into oncoming traffic in Columbus Circle, sideswiping cars as he ran pulling a carriage.<sup>46</sup>
12. On September 19, 2009, a taxi going south on Fifth Avenue turned into Central Park and plowed into a carriage horse buggy, knocking the buggy over and smashing it.<sup>47</sup>
13. On August 31, 2008, two carriage horses were spooked while pulling a wedding carriage in Bensonhurst, Brooklyn and took off into traffic, smashing into a car stopped at a red light and injuring the carriage driver.<sup>48</sup>
14. On September 14, 2007, a spooked horse reared up and turned its carriage over, charging a tree and another carriage. This sent a second horse running against traffic and plowing into a Mercedes-Benz. The horse died on the pavement near Center Drive in Central Park.<sup>49</sup>

---

<sup>42</sup> Kerry Wills, *Central Park horse-drawn carriage smacked by taxi cab, four people hurt*, NY DAILY NEWS (July 26, 2011), available at [http://www.nydailynews.com/ny\\_local/2011/07/26/2011-07-26\\_central\\_park\\_horsedrawn\\_carriage\\_smacked\\_by\\_taxi\\_cab\\_four\\_people\\_hurt.html?r=ny\\_local&utm\\_source=feedburner&utm\\_medium=feed&utm\\_campaign=Feed%3A+nydnrss%2Fny\\_local+%28NY+Local%29](http://www.nydailynews.com/ny_local/2011/07/26/2011-07-26_central_park_horsedrawn_carriage_smacked_by_taxi_cab_four_people_hurt.html?r=ny_local&utm_source=feedburner&utm_medium=feed&utm_campaign=Feed%3A+nydnrss%2Fny_local+%28NY+Local%29). (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>43</sup> Coalition to Ban Horse-Drawn Carriages Newsletter (July 17, 2011), available at <http://archive.constantcontact.com/fs054/1101376025369/archive/1106535174196.html>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>44</sup> Ben Yakas, *Carriage Horse vs. Bus in Midtown*, Gothamist.com (Nov. 6, 2010), at [http://gothamist.com/2010/11/06/carriage\\_horse\\_vs\\_bus\\_the\\_neverendi.php](http://gothamist.com/2010/11/06/carriage_horse_vs_bus_the_neverendi.php). (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>45</sup> Jen Carlson, *May Has Seen At Least Two Carriage Horse Crashes*, Gothamist.com (May 13, 2010), at [http://gothamist.com/2010/05/13/carriage\\_horse\\_crash.php](http://gothamist.com/2010/05/13/carriage_horse_crash.php). (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>46</sup> *Two Carriage Horse Accidents Just Days After NYC Mayor Signs Industry Bill*, Animal Law Coalition Web Page (May 16, 2010), at <http://www.animallawcoalition.com/animal-cruelty/article/278>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>47</sup> Jen Carlson, *Cab Collides With Horse & Buggy on UES*, Gothamist.com (Sept. 19, 2009); at [http://gothamist.com/2009/09/19/horse\\_buggy\\_struck\\_on\\_ues.php#photo-1](http://gothamist.com/2009/09/19/horse_buggy_struck_on_ues.php#photo-1). (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>48</sup> Simone Weichselbaum, *Workhorses get treatment after wedding carriage crash*, NY DAILY NEWS (Sept. 1, 2008), available at [http://articles.nydailynews.com/2008-09-01/local/17905296\\_1\\_dream-wedding-jacobson-plans-horses](http://articles.nydailynews.com/2008-09-01/local/17905296_1_dream-wedding-jacobson-plans-horses). (Last visited January 31, 2013.)



15. On July 3, 2007, a spooked horse flipped over his carriage and collided with a taxi on Central Park South. A motorcyclist and a bike were hit with the carriage. One person was hospitalized and the horse suffered several gashes on its right hind leg.<sup>50</sup>
16. On June 2, 2007, a spooked horse galloped into traffic still attached to his carriage. An SUV struck the horse at 54th Street and Seventh Avenue and the horse fell to the pavement.<sup>51</sup>
17. On April 13, 2007, a taxi crashed into a carriage while a horse was working.<sup>52</sup>
18. On May 5, 2006, a spooked horse ran through the street narrowly missing several cars before colliding with and overturning a moving car. The driver of the car was hospitalized and witnesses observed a gash on the horse's neck.<sup>53</sup>
19. On April 28, 2006, a spooked horse ran into a 71-year-old bicyclist at 64th Street and Central Drive. The bicyclist and horse-carriage driver were both hospitalized.<sup>54</sup>
20. On January 2, 2006, a spooked horse bolted down a street crashing into a station wagon at 50th Street and Ninth Avenue.<sup>55</sup> The drivers of the car were seriously injured and the carriage driver was hospitalized after being ejected from the carriage. The horse was pinned down under the car and he had to be euthanized the next day.<sup>56</sup>

---

<sup>49</sup> Kerry Burke and Michael White, *Carriage horse dies after tree crash in Central Park*, NY DAILY NEWS (Sept. 15, 2007), available at [http://www.nydailynews.com/news/2007/09/15/2007-09-15\\_carriage\\_horse\\_dies\\_after\\_tree\\_crash\\_nea.html](http://www.nydailynews.com/news/2007/09/15/2007-09-15_carriage_horse_dies_after_tree_crash_nea.html). (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>50</sup> Erin Calabrese and Dan Kadison, *Horse and Taxi in Tale of Whoa*, NY POST (July 5, 2007).

<sup>51</sup> Coalition to Ban Horse Drawn Carriages Web site, <http://www.banhdc.org/archives/ch-acc-20070602.html>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>52</sup> *Id.*, <http://www.banhdc.org/archives/ch-acc-20070413.html>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>53</sup> Associated Press, *Horse and Buggy Strike car in Manhattan. No Serious Injuries* (May 5, 2006), available at <http://www.banhdc.org/archives/ch-media-20050505.html>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>54</sup> Alison Gendar and Leo Standora, *Man Injured by Spooked Horse in Central Park*, NY DAILY NEWS (Apr. 29, 2006), available at <http://www.nydailynews.com/archives/news/man-injured-spooked-horse-central-park-article-1.627264>. (Last visited January 31, 2013.)

<sup>55</sup> Carrie Melago, *Horse Bolts & Injures 3 in Midtown*, NY DAILY NEWS (Jan. 3, 2006).

<sup>56</sup> Dillon et al., *Carriage Driver in Coma*, NY DAILY NEWS (Jan. 4, 2006), available at [http://articles.nydailynews.com/2006-01-04/news/18329121\\_1\\_carriage-horse-bizarre-accident](http://articles.nydailynews.com/2006-01-04/news/18329121_1_carriage-horse-bizarre-accident). (Last visited January 31, 2013.)